

TABLE 1 Potential data errors in the meta-analysis by Shen et al. [1] (discrepancies between the meta-analysis and original data highlighted in red)

Original study	Measure	Data reported by Shen et al.		Data reported in original study	
		WLC group	BLC group	WLC group	BLC group
Riedl et al. 2001 [3]	Patients, n	51	51	51	51
	Residual tumour rate	20/51	8/51	20/51	8/51
	CIS detection	1/51	0/51	1/51	0/51
Filbeck et al. 2002 [4]	Patients, n	150	151	150	151
	Total tumour detection rate	128/150	113/151	128/150	113/151
	Residual tumour rate	26/103	4/88	26/103	4/88
	CIS detection	7/103	9/88	5/103	5/88
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	76/103	61/88	76/103	79/88
Kriegmair et al. 2002 [5]	Patients, n	64	65	64	65
	Total tumour detection rate	61/64	60/65	61/64	60/65
	Residual tumour rate	23/49	35/52	26/49	17/52
	CIS detection	4/64	3/65	4/64	3/65
Babjuk et al. 2005 [6]	Patients, n	60	62	62	60
	Residual tumour rate	23/60	5/62	23/62	5/60
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	23/60	41/62	24/62	40/60
	Progression-free survival at 24 months	55/60	57/62	57/62 up to 15 months	55/60 up to 15 months
Daniltchenko et al. 2005 [7]	Patients, n	51	51	51	51
	Residual tumour rate	21/51	8/51	21/51	8/51
	CIS detection	1/51	0/51	1/51	0/51
	Recurrence-free survival at 3 months	24/51	10/51	27/51	41/51
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	31/51	22/51	20/51	29/51
Denzinger et al. 2007 [8]	Patients, n	150	151	103	88
	Total tumour detection rate	128/150	113/151	128/150	113/151
	Residual tumour rate	26/103	4/88	26/103	4/88
	CIS detection	8/103	9/88	5/103	5/88

TABLE 1 Potential data errors in the meta-analysis by Shen et al. [1] (discrepancies between the meta-analysis and original data highlighted in red)

Denzinger et al. 2008 [9]	Patients, n	150	151	25	21
	Residual tumour rate	10/25	3/21	10/25	3/21
	CIS detection	35/150	44/151	6/25	6/21
Burger et al. 2009 [10]	Patients, n	200	400	142	274 (139+135)
	Total tumour detection rate	179/200	386/400	Not reported	Not reported
	False-positive diagnosis rate	34/200	110/400	24/142	75/274 (36+39/139+135)
	Residual tumour rate	20/142	14/274	20/62	14/110 (9+5/57+53)
	CIS detection	6/142	12/274	6/142	12/274 (7+5/139+135)
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	95/142	255/274	111/142	255/274 (131+124/139+135)
	Progression-free survival at 24 months	138/142	261/274	138/142	261/274 (131+130/139+135)
Geavlete et al. 2010 [11]	Patients, n	223	223	223	223
	Total tumour detection rate	192/223	208/223	192/223	208/223
	Residual tumour rate	20/159	8/176	20/64	8/72
	CIS detection	18/159	23/176	18/159	23/176
Stenzl et al. 2010 [12]	Patients, n	384	365	384	382
	Total tumour detection rate	372/384	356/365	369/384	365/382
	CIS detection	9/202	32/200	Not reported for group randomised to WLC, but 28 of 41 pts with CIS in BLC group had CIS detected on WLC	41/365
Schumacher et al. 2010 [13]	Patients, n	138	141	138	141
	Total tumour detection rate	121/138	125/141	119/138	119/141
	CIS detection	18/138	6/141	18/138	6/141
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	77/138	78/141	77/138	78/141
	Progression-free survival at 12 months	123/138	128/141	123/138	128/141

TABLE 1 Potential data errors in the meta-analysis by Shen et al. [1] (discrepancies between the meta-analysis and original data highlighted in red)

Stenzl et al. 2011 [14]	Patients, n	183	187	Placebo: 183	187
	Total tumour detection rate	180/183	186/187	Placebo: 149/176	162/183
	CIS detection	22/176	25/185	Placebo: 22/176	25/183
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	128/176	117/183	Placebo: 128/176	117/183
	Progression-free survival at 12 months	157/176	164/183	Placebo: 157/176	164/183
Hermann et al. 2011 [15]	Patients, n	117	102	117	102
	False-positive diagnosis rate	19/117	25/102	19/117	25/102
	CIS detection	3/117	4/102	Not reported	Not reported
	Recurrence-free survival at 3 months	74/77	64/68	51/74 at 4 months	49/59 at 4 months
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	32/77	50/68	39/51	41/49
The authors warn: "the two rates cannot be compared as suspicious areas detected under white light were removed before HAL fluorescence was used"					
Drăgoescu et al. 2011 [16]	Patients, n	30	27	22	22
	Total tumour detection rate	22/30	22/27	22/22	22/22
	False-positive diagnosis rate	7/30	4/27	7/22	4/22
	Recurrence-free survival at 3 months	19/22	21/22	19/22	21/22
	Recurrence-free survival at 12 months	12/22	18/22	12/22	18/22
	Progression-free survival at 12 months	20/22	21/22	20/22	21/22